



April 19, 2023

Ms. Corinna Prior, Planner
Community Planning Department
Toronto & East York District
Toronto City Hall
100 Queen Street West
Toronto, ON
M5H 2N2

MICHAEL GOLDBERG, MCIP, RPP
mgoldberg@goldberggroup.ca
(416) 322-6364 EXT. 2100

Dear Corinna Prior:

RE: Planning Addendum Letter
145 St. George Street, City of Toronto
File No. 21 155923 STE 11 OZ, 21 155930 STE 11 SA and 21 155940 STE 11 RH

Introduction

We are the planning consultants for Tenblock, owners of the lands, municipally known as 145 St. George Street (the "subject site"). A Zoning By-law Amendment (ZBA) application, Site Plan Approval (SPA) and Rental Housing Demolition (RHD) applications were jointly submitted on May 5, 2021 proposing a 29-storey residential building. Since then, the proposal has changed considering the circulation of comments received from City staff and external agencies as further detailed below.

The purpose of this Planning Addendum Letter is to identify the key revisions to the plans and to provide our planning opinion concerning these revisions. Our original Planning Report (dated May 5, 2021) should be treated as a companion document to this Planning Addendum Letter.

Revised Proposal

The revised proposal is shown on the architectural plans prepared by architectsAlliance, re-issued on April 19, 2023, being submitted as part of this resubmission.

A comparison of the initial and revised proposal is outlined in the following table:

Site and Building Statistics			
	Initial Submission (May 2021)	Resubmission (April 2023)	Net Change
Site Area	2,276 sq.m. (0.56 ac.)	2,276 sq.m. (0.56 ac.)	No change
Total Gross Floor Area (GFA)	23,076.4 sq.m.	23,965 sq.m.	+888.6 sq.m.
Proposed Residential GFA	23,076.4 sq.m.	23,748 sq.m.	+671.6 sq.m.
Proposed Retail GFA	0 sq.m.	131 sq.m.	+131 sq.m.
POPS Area	317.1 sq.m.	Removed per City's request	
Floor Space Index	10.1	10.5	+0.4
Tower Floorplate	750 sq.m.	750 sq.m.	No change
Grand Total Units	341	398	+57
Total Market Units	211	256	+45
Studio	0	29	+29
One-bedroom	151	156	+5
Two-bedroom	37	39	+2
Three-bedroom	23	32	+9
Total Rental Units	130	142	+12
Studio	72	72	No change
One-bedroom	45	52	+7
Two-bedroom	13	16	+3
Three-bedroom	0	2	+2
Amenity Space	1,233.6 sq.m.	1,592 sq.m.	+358.4 sq.m.
Indoor Amenity Space	719.5 sq.m. (2.1 sq.m./unit)	796 sq.m. (2.0 sq.m./unit)	+76.5sq.m.
Outdoor Amenity Space	514.1 sq.m. (1.5 sqm./unit)	796 (2.0 sq.m./unit)	+281.9 sq.m.
Height	29 storeys	28 storeys	-1 storey
Building Height (excluding MPH)	92.15 m	88.04 m	-4.11 m
Building Height (including MPH)	98.15 m	95.64	-2.51 m
Podium Height	23.6 m	23.6 m	No change
Parking			
Number of Vehicle Parking Spaces (cumulative)	94	5	-89
Number of Bicycle Parking Spaces	345	478	+133

Notable features of the revised proposal include the following:

- The proposed redevelopment consists of a 28-storey residential apartment building including amenity spaces. A total of 398 dwelling units are proposed, of which a total of 130 dwelling units represent the rental replacement units that currently exist on the subject site. Furthermore, the owners have worked closely with Housing staff and have revised the proposal to include 12 additional net new affordable rental units. This is further detailed in the Housing Issues Report addendum letter.
- The building height (including the MPH) has been reduced from 98.15 m to 95.64 m. Furthermore, the proposed building is sculpted to gradually step back diagonally from the northeast corner of the tower starting from the 25th floor until the mechanical

penthouse floor level, providing a gradual height transition towards the neighbourhood to the north and further reducing shadow impacts onto its surroundings.

- The proposed building is setback at ground level 10 m from the west property line (St. George Street), 4.5 m from the south property line (Prince Arthur Avenue), 3 m from the north property line, and 7 m from the east property line.
- The podium height remains unchanged at a height of 23.6 m. The podium is shifted closer to the Prince Arthur Avenue frontage from the second to seventh floors with a setback of 1.3 m from the south property line (Prince Arthur Avenue). This was done to clearly define the podium and create a vertical separation of the tower above.
- A tower reveal is proposed on the 8th floor on all four sides of the tower in order to accentuate the podium and the tower separation further. This floor is setback 11.1 m from the west property line (St. George Street), 13.5 m from the north property line, 12.5 m from the east property line, and 5.5 m from the south property line (Prince Arthur Avenue).
- Between the 9th and 24th floors, the tower element is setback 10 m from the west property line (St. George Street), 12.5 m from the north property line, 12.5 m from the east property line, and 4.5 m from the south property line (Prince Arthur Avenue).
- A non-residential use is proposed at grade fronting St. George Street with a total GFA of 131 sq.m., targeted to be leased as a 'bike café and repair shop', as well as a Bikeshare station located at south of the retail space, catering to residents and the surrounding neighbourhood for further promoting the use of bicycles as an alternative means of travel and as a conveniently located gathering space.
- The ground floor has been reconfigured from the original submission with the inclusion of the non-residential use.
 - The residential lobby has been relocated towards the southwest quadrant of the subject site, immediately east of the proposed bike café, addressing the south (Prince Arthur Avenue) frontage, with direct access and visibility to/from the sidewalk. The mail and parcel room, and elevators continue to be located adjacent to the residential lobby. The rental office is proposed to be located immediately east of the residential lobby, towards the Prince Arthur Avenue frontage.
 - The entrance to the proposed non-residential use is located on the western frontage and is contiguous with a landscaped open space. This expansion of the public realm further improves the pedestrian experience with landscaping and seating and brings prominence to the intersection.
 - The ground floor amenity spaces are relocated further north in the proposed building, including indoor amenity spaces for a pet washing facility, a mudroom for messy activities, and a fitness centre. These amenity spaces have direct access to the proposed outdoor amenity space and outdoor dog relief area on the north side of the building.

- The loading area continues to be located towards the east side of the proposed building. Driveway access to and from the loading and surface visitor and car-share parking is provided to/from Prince Arthur Avenue, at the southeast corner of the subject site. Also, public drop-off and pick-up parking spaces (PUDO) are proposed on Prince Arthur Avenue curbside in front of the building entrance. One (1) Type “G” loading space is proposed. All back of house operations are internalized into the proposed building so that these activities are not visible from the street or sidewalk.
- The original proposal included two levels of underground parking and a total of 94 vehicle parking spaces. The revised proposal removes all underground parking spaces and the vehicular ramp at the northeast corner of the subject site. A total of five (5) parking spaces, allocated for visitor and car-share parking adjacent to the loading area. Three (3) of the parking spaces are located towards the northeast corner of the subject site and two (2) parking spaces, including one (1) accessible parking space, are located toward the southeast corner of the subject site.
- The proposed number of bicycle parking spaces have increased from a total of 345 spaces to a total of 478 spaces. The distribution of bicycle parking is as follows:

Type	No. of Bicycle Parking Spaces
Residential Long Term	398
Residential Short Term	80

40 short-term / visitor bicycle parking spaces are located at grade in proximity to the bike café and the building entrances. Remaining 40 short-term / visitor bicycle parking spaces are located in the basement. All long-term / resident bicycle parking spaces are located within high-quality bicycle parking facilities with bicycle washing and maintenance stations in the basement level. A bicycle ramp is proposed immediately north of the proposed loading area, providing direct and independent access to the bicycle parking facility in the basement.

- The basement level also includes residential storage lockers and 85 sq.m. of indoor amenity space with uses connected to the adjacent bicycle facilities.
- Three (3) townhouse units are proposed fronting Prince Arthur Avenue. Each unit is accessible directly from Prince Arthur Avenue. Upgraded landscaping with additional new trees will compliment the existing trees on the boulevard along Prince Arthur Avenue and achieve a double-row of trees for an improved pedestrian experience.
- Residential Amenity space is provided as follows:

Indoor Amenity: 796 sq.m. (2.0 sq.m./dwelling unit)
Outdoor Amenity: 796 sq.m. (2.0 sq.m./dwelling unit)
Total: 1,592 sq.m.

- A total of 131 sq.m. of residential indoor amenity space is proposed on the ground floor of the building contiguous with 141 sq.m. of outdoor amenity

- space proposed in the form of a pet washing facility, a mudroom for messy activities, a fitness centre and a pet relief area in the outdoor amenity space.
- As mentioned earlier, a total of 85 sq.m. of indoor amenity space is provided in the basement level connected to the adjacent bicycle facility.
 - A total of 55 sq.m. of indoor amenity space is provided on the mezzanine level contiguous with 55 sq.m. of outdoor amenity space located towards the northeast corner of the proposed building.
 - Furthermore, a total of 525 sq.m. of indoor amenity is provided on the 8th floor, contiguous with a total of 601 sq.m. of outdoor amenity wrapping around the tower. Indoor amenity space uses will be programmed in the future, which will also consider a flexible space for communal gathering and a full kitchen. The outdoor amenity terrace located on this floor will be screened from adjacent properties with broad and dense planters along the north and eastern perimeter of the terrace, to minimize or mitigate any perceived privacy, overlook and noise and wind implications.
- The Privately Owned Publicly Accessible Space (POPS) that was previously proposed will no longer be used as a POPS space as per the City's direction. The space to the west of the proposed building will however continue to function as a landscaped open space and outdoor patio with outdoor artwork and landscape furniture that is contiguous with the public realm to the west and the proposed bike café inside the building.
 - The updated Pedestrian Level Wind Study report indicates significantly improved wind conditions at grade are predicted to be acceptable for their intended pedestrian uses throughout the year. Similarly, wind conditions at common amenity terraces have also improved. During the typical use period, the common amenity terrace on the Mezzanine level is predicted to be calm and suitable for sitting. The common amenity terrace on the 8th floor is predicted to have comfortable conditions for sitting and standing during the typical use period. In spring, there is a walking condition partially at northeast and northwest corners in spring where planters and trellis are proposed to mitigate wind conditions. The landscaping and programming of the amenity terrace respond to the predicted wind comfort conditions. These conditions are deemed satisfactory to Official Plan Policies, 3.1.3.1. (f) which includes both sitting and standing as acceptable conditions and 3.1.3.13 (d).
 - An intensive Green Roof is proposed on the mezzanine level (56sq.m.) next to the proposed outdoor amenity space on the same level and on the roof top (29sq.m.).
 - The proposal is targeting Tier 2 of the Toronto Green Standards (v3) and further details will be determined as part of the Site Plan process.

Planning Analysis

The subject site is located within three (3) *Major Transit Station Areas*, as defined by the Growth Plan. It is also located in the *Downtown and Central Waterfront* on Map 2 of the City Official Plan (City OP), and within *Apartment Neighbourhoods* on Map 17 of the City OP.

These policy areas promote and encourage transit-supportive development that responds to the existing and planned context, subject to specific criteria of the Official Plan. The height, scale and overall design of the proposed 28-storey building is appropriate in this Downtown context, and is in keeping with the existing and planned character of this part of the *Downtown* area.

Further to the above policy context, on December 14, 2022, Council adopted the 2023 Housing Action Plan as recommended by Mayor Tory, with a goal of meeting or exceeding the provincial housing target of 285,000 new homes over the next 10 years for both market, non-market and hybrid housing production. This is a strong indication of Council's latest direction to prioritize housing creation in the City of Toronto. The proposal includes a total of 398 units, an addition of 268 units from what previously existed on the subject site. Out of the total proposed units, a minimum of 142 units are rental units, of which 12 are new affordable rental units, and 130 are rental replacement units, exceeding full replacement. As mentioned earlier, this is further detailed in the Housing Issues Report addendum letter.

The overall height of the proposed building has been reduced from 98.15 m to 95.64 m. In addition, gradual stepbacks of the upper floors are sculpted into the building from the northeast corner of the proposed tower, further providing a visual height transition towards the neighbourhood to the north and reduce shadow implications onto surrounding *Neighbourhoods* and *Parks*, and open spaces. The updated Shadow Study prepared by Urban Strategies Inc., dated April 13, 2022, demonstrates that minimal net new shadows are cast onto the southern corners of Taddle Creek Park on September 21, starting from 2:18 pm and move out of the park shortly after 4:18 pm. It is important to note that the shadows are quick-moving and no new shadows are cast onto the playground within Taddle Creek Park between March 21 and September 21. In our opinion, based on this review, we are satisfied that the revised proposal adequately limits shadow impacts on the adjacent *Neighbourhoods*, *Parks*, and open spaces.

The height, massing and other urban design features of this proposal continue to be carefully and thoughtfully deployed in consideration of the surrounding area and context of the subject site. The proposed redevelopment continues to create a well-designed, high quality residential building on this underutilized subject site, offering a range of residential unit types and tenures, and amenities that are compatible with its surrounding area context.

Small-scale retail uses are permitted in *Apartment Neighbourhoods* per policy 4.2.1. of the City OP. As such, a 'bike café and repair shop' has been proposed at grade fronting St. George Street. This added use will enhance the safety and animation of St. George Street, in accordance with policy 4.2.2.(g) of the City OP, and will be an amenity to the site and residents in the area as a potential gathering space. Additionally, it will further promote and support the use of bicycles, as an alternative to vehicular travel.

The parking supply has been reduced from 94 parking spaces to five (5) parking spaces for short term visitors and car-share. On October 12, 2022, the Ontario Land Tribunal (OLT) issued an order approving By-law 89-2022, amending Zoning By-law 569-2013 with updated

parking standards for automobiles. The subject site is located in Parking Zone A (PZA). The parking rates applicable to residential dwelling units within PZA areas restrict parking spaces to a maximum amount and without any minimum amount. As such, no long-term residential parking spaces have been proposed. Residential visitor spaces within PZA areas are however required at a minimum rate of 2.0 plus 0.01 per dwelling unit. As such, the required amount of visitor parking spaces in this case is five (5) parking spaces and the revised proposal meets this requirement with visitor and car-share parking spaces.

Further to the above, it is our opinion that the proposed parking standard is appropriate for this *Downtown* location. There are existing dedicated bike lanes along St. George Street and Prince Arthur Avenue which already support and promote cycling. The subject site is also located in extremely close proximity to the St. George subway station, being 60 m away (approximately a 1-2 minute walk) and Spadina subway station approximately 300 m west of the subject site, both of which are interchange stations. The Museum subway station is located approximately 500 m to the east of the subject site. This makes the subject site within three (3) Major Transit Station Areas (MTSA) as defined by the Growth Plan. The subject site is also within extremely close walking proximity to shops, services, the University of Toronto campus, museums, restaurants, entertainment, commercial retail, and other amenities of the *Downtown* and nearby areas. From a policy perspective, the Growth Plan provides policies supporting reduced parking standards as a means to support MTSA's and as a means to support intensifications.

The proposal targets Tier 2 of the Toronto Green Standard (v3) and details will be determined through the Site Plan process. The updated Carbon Analysis Report, prepared by Footprint dated January 16, 2023 concludes that the updated proposal in comparison to the original proposal will further decrease the embodied carbon emissions per unit by approximately 24%, and the annual emissions by approximately 34% by pursuing TGS tier 2 in the revised proposal. The carbon positive timeline for the proposal has also improved from 13 years to 8.6 years.

In our opinion, the subject proposal continues to meet the applicable policies of the City OP and the Downtown Plan. As such, an Official Plan Amendment (OPA) application is not required. The proposal requires amendment to the City-wide Zoning By-law 569-2013 to permit the proposed development.

Conclusions

This Planning Addendum Letter summarizes the built form revisions made to the proposal.

The Provincial policies contained in the PPS and Growth Plan actively promote and encourage compact urban form, intensification, optimization of the existing land base and infrastructure, and development which will take better advantage of existing public transit. It is through increased density that derives support for the significant public investment in rapid transit and encourages the use of alternative modes of transportation such as public transit, walking, and cycling. We conclude that the revised proposal continues to advance the policy

imperatives expressed in these two Provincial policy documents, and is therefore consistent with the PPS and conforms with the Growth Plan.

In addition, the revised proposal conforms with, and satisfies, the applicable Official Plan and Downtown Plan policies related to Healthy Neighbourhoods, *Apartment Neighbourhoods*, Housing, Public Realm and Built Form, as reviewed in this Planning Addendum Letter and in the original Planning Report. The proposal also generally satisfies the visions for the subject site as expressed in the applicable City guidelines for tall buildings. As such, it has been demonstrated that the subject site can appropriately accommodate the height and density proposed. In view of this, the subject proposal is an appropriate development for this location and will be compatible and fitting with the existing and planned context of the subject site.

For the reasons stated above, it is our opinion that the revised proposal represents good planning, is in the public interest, satisfies the policies of the Province and it appropriately implements the City's Official Plan. We therefore recommend approval of this revised proposal to both City staff and City Council. If you have any questions or require additional information, please do not hesitate to contact the undersigned at 416-523-4598.

Yours truly,

GOLDBERG GROUP

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Michael Goldberg', is written over a faint, light-colored rectangular stamp or watermark.

Michael Goldberg MCIP, RPP
Principal

cc. Tenblock